A comparison of gas exchange indices used to detect the anaerobic threshold

VINCENT J. CAIOZZO, JAMES A. DAVIS, JEAN F. ELLIS, JEFF L. AZUS,
RICHARD VANDAGRIFF, CARLOS A. PRIETTO, AND WILLIAM C. McMASTER

Human Performance Laboratory, Division of Orthopedic Surgery, Department of Surgery,
College of Medicine, University of California, Irvine, California 92717

Caiozzo, Vincent J., James A. Davis, Jean F. Ellis, Jeff L. Azus, Richard Vandagriff, Carlos A. Prietto, and William C. McMaster. A comparison of gas exchange indices used to detect the anaerobic threshold. J. Appl. Physiol.: Respirat. Environ. Exercise Physiol. 53(5): 1184-1189, 1982.—This study was undertaken to determine which of four commonly used ventilatory or gas exchange indices provides the most accurate and reliable detection of the anaerobic threshold (AT). Sixteen subjects performed two cycle ergometer tests to volitional fatigue. After 4 min of unloaded cycling, the work rate was increased 20 W/min. Ventilatory and gas exchange measurements were made every 30 s throughout each test. During one of the two tests (randomly assigned), venous blood was also sampled every 30 s for subsequent determinations of blood lactate (HLa) concentration. Four ventilatory and gas exchange indices (VE, VCO2, R, VE/VO2) were used separately to detect the AT. The AT determined from systematic increases in HLa concentration was used as the criterion measure. AT values (means ± SE) (VO2l/min) using VE, VCO2, R, VE/VO2, and HLa were 1.79 ± 0.11, 1.74 ± 0.11, 1.58 ± 0.06, 1.84 ± 0.11, and 1.85 ± 0.11 l/min, respectively. The highest correlation between a ventilatory or gas exchange AT and ATHLa (i.e., criterion measure) was found for VE/VO2 (r = 0.93, P < 0.001). The VE/VO2 also provided the highest test-retest correlation for detection of the AT (r = 0.93, P < 0.001). Multiple correlational analyses did not significantly enhance detection of the AT. These results favor the use of VE/VO2 for noninvasive detection of the AT because it proved to be the most sensitive and reliable ventilatory or gas exchange index studied.

Initially, the anaerobic threshold (AT) was used clinically by Wasserman et al. (13, 16) to assess the exercise tolerance of individuals with cardiorespiratory diseases. However, in recent years, interest in the AT has become much more diversified. To date, some of the other applications of the AT include 1) its use in characterizing endurance athletes (11); 2) exercise prescription (3); 3) studying the effect of drugs on exercise tolerance (3, 17); 4) using the AT to measure the effects of endurance training (1); 5) correlating the AT with muscle fiber composition and biochemical properties of skeletal muscle (4, 6, 11, 12); and 6) predicting endurance performance (4, 12). With respect to endurance performance, the AT has recently (18) been described as a key parameter which, to a large extent, defines the ability to sustain high-intensity exercise.

To facilitate detection of the AT, numerous investigators have used noninvasive ventilatory and/or gas exchange indices. The AT has been identified by nonlinear increases in minute ventilation (2, 5, 6, 9, 11, 14, 17), nonlinear increases in CO2 output (2, 9, 14, 16), abrupt systematic increases in the respiratory exchange ratio (2, 7, 13, 14, 16), and systematic increases in the ventilatory equivalent for O2 uptake without concomitant increases in the ventilatory equivalent for CO2 output (1, 10, 15, 18).

While earlier studies (2, 10, 13, 16) established the feasibility of using noninvasive techniques to detect the AT, it still remains undetermined as to which of the above indices most accurately detects the AT. It has been suggested previously (1) that the AT is easier to detect using the ventilatory equivalent for O2 uptake (VE/VO2) compared with either minute ventilation (VE) or CO2 output (VCO2). Also, the feasibility of using the respiratory exchange ratio (R) for detection of the AT has been questioned (2, 16). In addition to the accuracy of detecting the AT, another important consideration is the test-retest reliability of noninvasive AT determinations. While Davis et al. (1) reported a test-retest correlation of 0.94 using VE/VO2 to detect the AT, it is unknown how reliable the other indices might be.

Due to these considerations, there were two primary objectives of this investigation. The first objective was to individually correlate ventilatory and gas exchange AT values (i.e., VE, VCO2, R, VE/VO2) with the values determined from blood lactate (HLa) analyses in an effort to find which index yielded the highest correlation with the criterion measure (ATHLa). The second objective was to identify the test-retest correlation of each ventilatory and gas exchange AT. An additional consideration of this study was to examine whether specific combinations of ventilatory and/or gas exchange indices could significantly enhance detection of the AT compared with the use of single indices.

METHODS

Sixteen male (n = 14) and female (n = 2) subjects between 20 and 31 yr participated in this study. The mean (±SE) age and weight of the subjects were 23.1 ±
0.9 yr and 72.9 ± 3.0 kg, respectively. See Table 1 for individual data. The activity levels of the subjects varied considerably (sedentary to jogging 7 mi/day). Each subject was informed of all risks and stresses associated with this project and gave written consent to participate in this investigation.

Each subject participated in two test sessions. During each session, the subject was seated on a cycle ergometer (Monark model 850, Quinton Instruments, Seattle, WA) and instructed to begin pedaling at 80 rpm. The first 4 min of each test consisted of unloaded cycling after which time the work rate was increased by 20 W/min until the subject reached volitional fatigue.

During both of the test sessions, the subject breathed through a low-resistance Daniels valve (R-PEL, Los Altos, CA). The expiratory side of the breathing valve was connected to a 5-liter mixing chamber. Using the procedures of Wilmore and Costill (19), gas samples were drawn from the mixing chamber and analyzed for the fraction of mixed expired O\textsubscript{2} (F\textsubscript{E}O\textsubscript{2}) and the fraction of mixed expired CO\textsubscript{2} (F\textsubscript{ECO\textsubscript{2}}) using a S-3A O\textsubscript{2} analyzer (Applied Electrochemistry, Sunnyvale, CA) and an LB-2 CO\textsubscript{2} analyzer (Beckman, Fullerton, CA), respectively. The inspiratory side of the breathing valve was connected to a Parkinson-Cowan dry gas spirometer (model 1/a 9001E, Dynasciences, Blue Bell, PA). To measure the volume of inspired air, the gas meter was fitted with an optical encoder (model R02533-A50-P18, Renco, Santa Barbara, CA) that provided pulses to a digital panel meter (model 6110, Newport Laboratories, Costa Mesa, CA). Using the optical encoder, it was possible to obtain a volume resolution of 0.2 liter. Every 30 s during the test F\textsubscript{EO\textsubscript{2}}, F\textsubscript{ECO\textsubscript{2}}, and inspiratory volume were fed into a computer (CBM 2001-16, Commodore Business Machines, Santa Clara, CA), and following these procedures it was possible to obtain prnintouts every 30 s of VE, V\textsubscript{CO\textsubscript{2}}, VO\textsubscript{2}, R, F\textsubscript{EO\textsubscript{2}}, F\textsubscript{ECO\textsubscript{2}}, VE/VO\textsubscript{2} and the ventilatory equivalent for CO\textsubscript{2} output (VE/VO\textsubscript{2}). After the completion of a test, each of these variables could also be plotted against time.

During one of the two test sessions (randomly assigned), 1-ml blood samples were drawn repeatedly from a nonheparinized 21-gauge vein infusion set (Miniset, Travenol Laboratories, Deerfield, IL) that had been inserted into an antecubital vein. Blood samples were drawn throughout the test at 30-s intervals, corresponding with ventilatory and gas exchange measurements. The blood samples were analyzed for HLa concentration using an ultraviolet enzymatic technique (626-UV, Sigma Diagnostics, St. Louis, MO).

The single indices used individually to determine the AT values of each subject were VE, V\textsubscript{CO\textsubscript{2}}, R, VE/VO\textsubscript{2}, and HLa, which was the criterion measure. For each of these indices, the following criteria were employed in selecting the AT: 1) AT\textsubscript{VE} corresponded to the time at which VE began to increase nonlinearly; 2) AT\textsubscript{V\textsubscript{CO\textsubscript{2}}} corresponded to the time at which V\textsubscript{CO\textsubscript{2}} began to increase nonlinearly; 3) AT\textsubscript{R} corresponded to the time at which R demonstrated an abrupt systematic increase; 4) AT\textsubscript{VE/VO\textsubscript{2}} corresponded to the time at which VE/VO\textsubscript{2} exhibited a systematic increase without a concomitant increase in VE/V\textsubscript{CO\textsubscript{2}}; and 5) AT\textsubscript{HLa} corresponded to the time at which there was a systematic increase in HLa above base-line warm-up values. F\textsubscript{EO\textsubscript{2}} was not used in this study to detect the AT because increases in the F\textsubscript{EO\textsubscript{2}} are analogous to increases in VE/VO\textsubscript{2} (10). According to the criteria outlined above, an independent investigator, who was not involved in the test sessions and was unfamiliar with the subject population, blindly reviewed the plots of each index mentioned above and made determinations of AT values. All AT values are expressed as VO\textsubscript{2} (l/min). The transformation of AT values from time to VO\textsubscript{2} (l/min) was performed by computing the linear regression equation for VO\textsubscript{2} vs. time.

All correlational analyses were done by computer using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (8). In all statistical analyses, the 0.05 level of significance was used.

### RESULTS

The individual AT values (\(\dot{V}\text{O}_2\), l/min) for the subjects as determined by using each single index (i.e., VE, V\textsubscript{CO\textsubscript{2}}, R, VE/VO\textsubscript{2}, and HLa) are reported in Table 1. The mean (±SE) AT values for each of these indices are 1.79 ± 0.11, 1.74 ± 0.11, 1.58 ± 0.11, 1.84 ± 0.11, and 1.85 ± 0.11 l/min, respectively. A zero-order correlation matrix for these indices is presented in Table 2. As shown in this table and illustrated in Fig. 1, the highest correlation between any single ventilatory or gas exchange AT and AT\textsubscript{HLa} (i.e., the criterion measure) was found for VE/VO\textsubscript{2} (r = 0.93, P < 0.001). AT\textsubscript{HLa} had the lowest correlation with AT\textsubscript{HLa} (r = 0.39, P > 0.05). As illustrated in Fig. 2, VE/VO\textsubscript{2} also provided the highest test-retest correlation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subj No.</th>
<th>Age, yr</th>
<th>Wt, kg</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>VE</th>
<th>V\textsubscript{CO\textsubscript{2}}</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>VE/VO\textsubscript{2}</th>
<th>HLa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>83.4</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.65</td>
<td>5.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>61.9</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>2.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>84.1</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>62.6</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>76.0</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>1.56</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>58.5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1.81</td>
<td>1.81</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>2.26</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>68.5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>84.6</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>96.8</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.96</td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td>1.84</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>77.1</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>63.6</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>85.2</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.88</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>2.26</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>62.1</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean ± SE

|       | 23.1   | 72.9   | 1.79 | 1.74 | 1.84 | 1.85 |

**Table 1. Age, weight, sex, and anaerobic thresholds of subjects**
for determinations of the AT ($r = 0.93$, $P < 0.001$).

Multiple regression analyses, biased for a small population sample, were performed using $AT_{HLA}$ as the dependent variable and $AT_{VE}$, $AT_{VCO}_2$, and $AT_{VE/V_O2}$ as independent variables. As might be predicted from Table 2, the multiple correlation coefficient did not increase significantly when $AT_{VE}$ and $AT_{VCO}_2$ were combined with $AT_{VE/V_O2}$. R was not used in multiple correlational analyses because in four of the subjects, R increased steadily throughout the entire test and no abrupt systematic increase could be discerned.

**DISCUSSION**

While previous studies (2, 10, 13, 16) have shown that during exercise the onset of lactic acidosis (i.e., the AT) can be detected using ventilatory and/or gas exchange indices, the purpose of this study was to extend these earlier findings by determining which of four commonly used indices (i.e., $VE$, $VCO_2$, R, or $VE/V_O2$) provided the most accurate and reliable detection of the AT. Based upon these two criteria (i.e., accuracy and reliability), it was found that $VE/V_O2$ was the best single index for detecting the AT. There are several considerations that might account for this finding. First, using the present protocol with work rate durations of 1 min, there were marked qualitative differences between the patterns of response for $T_E$, $h_02$, and $VE/VO_2$. During the tests, for determinations of the AT ($r = 0.93$, $P < 0.001$).

Multiple regression analyses, biased for a small population sample, were performed using $AT_{HLA}$ as the dependent variable and $AT_{VE}$, $AT_{VCO}_2$, and $AT_{VE/V_O2}$ as independent variables. As might be predicted from Table 2, the multiple correlation coefficient did not increase significantly when $AT_{VE}$ and $AT_{VCO}_2$ were combined with $AT_{VE/V_O2}$. R was not used in multiple correlational analyses because in four of the subjects, R increased steadily throughout the entire test and no abrupt systematic increase could be discerned.

**DISCUSSION**

While previous studies (2, 10, 13, 16) have shown that during exercise the onset of lactic acidosis (i.e., the AT) can be detected using ventilatory and/or gas exchange indices, the purpose of this study was to extend these earlier findings by determining which of four commonly used indices (i.e., $VE$, $VCO_2$, R, or $VE/V_O2$) provided the most accurate and reliable detection of the AT. Based upon these two criteria (i.e., accuracy and reliability), it was found that $VE/V_O2$ was the best single index for detecting the AT. There are several considerations that might account for this finding. First, using the present protocol with work rate durations of 1 min, there were marked qualitative differences between the patterns of response for $VE$, $VCO_2$, and $VE/V_O2$. During the tests,
FIG. 2. Test-retest correlation for ventilatory and gas exchange anaerobic threshold determinations. Respiratory exchange ratio is not included because it did not reliably yield detectable AT values based on criteria outlined in METHODS.

\[
\dot{V}E \text{ ANAEROBIC THRESHOLD} \\
\text{(\\dot{V}\text{O}_2, l/min)}
\]

\[
\dot{V}C\text{O}_2 \text{ ANAEROBIC THRESHOLD} \\
\text{(\\dot{V}\text{O}_2, l/min)}
\]

\[
\dot{V}E/\\dot{V}\text{O}_2 \text{ ANAEROBIC THRESHOLD} \\
\text{(\\dot{V}\text{O}_2, l/min)}
\]

\[
\dot{V}E = 0.88X + 0.33 l/min \\
r = 0.89 \\
S_y-x = 0.19 l/min \\
n = 16
\]

\[
\dot{V}C\text{O}_2 = 0.84X + 0.32 l/min \\
r = 0.78 \\
S_y-x = 0.26 l/min \\
n = 16
\]

\[
\dot{V}E/\\dot{V}\text{O}_2 = 0.88X + 0.29 l/min \\
r = 0.93 \\
S_y-x = 0.15 l/min \\
n = 16
\]

FIG. 3. Ventilatory, gas exchange, and venous blood lactate measurements for subject 10. First dashed line indicates onset of incremental work. Second dashed line represents ATin. Ventilatory equivalent data are calculated and reported as VE BTPS divided by \(VCI~\) or vco2 STPD. See text for definitions.

\[
\dot{V}E/\\dot{V}\text{O}_2 \text{ ANAEROBIC THRESHOLD} \\
\text{(\\dot{V}\text{O}_2, l/min)}
\]

\[
\dot{V}E/\\dot{V}\text{O}_2 = 0.88X + 0.33 l/min \\
r = 0.89 \\
S_y-x = 0.19 l/min \\
n = 16
\]

\[
\dot{V}C\text{O}_2 = 0.84X + 0.32 l/min \\
r = 0.78 \\
S_y-x = 0.26 l/min \\
n = 16
\]

\[
\dot{V}E/\\dot{V}\text{O}_2 = 0.88X + 0.29 l/min \\
r = 0.93 \\
S_y-x = 0.15 l/min \\
n = 16
\]

VE/VO2 would typically fall initially, flatten, and then rise steadily at the AT (Fig. 3). In contrast to this triphasic pattern, VE and VCO2 would rise continuously throughout the test, leaving us with less confidence about where the nonlinear break point occurred. A second consideration is the “dual” criterion that was used in selecting ATVE/VO2. As mentioned in METHODS, ATVE/VO2 was chosen making sure that there was not a concomitant increase in VE/VCO2. It has been reported by Wasserman et al. (15) that this dual criterion provides a more specific determination of the AT, delineating its identification from other causes of nonlinear increases in ventilation such as neurogenic factors or exercise-induced hypoxemia.

With regards to the accuracy of detecting the AT using VE/VO2, it is interesting to note that our findings are similar to the observations of Reinhard et al. (10) who found a correlation coefficient of 0.94 when comparing ATVE/VO2 with ATHLa. Additionally, the test-retest correlation coefficient (r = 0.93) we obtained using VE/VO2 to
detect the AT is consistent with the findings of Davis et al. (1) who reported a test-retest correlation coefficient of 0.94 for AT VH/VO2.

While the difference between the mean AT VH/VO2 and mean AT VH/VO2 was only 0.01 l/min for the subjects as a group (see Table 1), the mean (±SE) individual error, disregarding the sign of the error, was 0.13 ± 0.02 l/min, which corresponds to a mean (±SE) relative error of 7.4 ± 1.0%. On the average, the determination of AT VH/VO2 was one sample interval (i.e., 30 s) different from AT VH/VO2. We suspect that this error might be reduced by using shorter collection intervals (e.g., 15 s) or continuous breath-by-breath measurement techniques.

Contrasting the earlier data of Davis et al. (2) with data reported by Reinhard et al. (10), it might have been expected that the AT would be detected more accurately using VE/VO2 rather than by using VE. However, in light of the fact that Davis et al. (2) expressed their AT data as a percent of VO2 max (%VO2 max) and Reinhard et al. (10) chose to express their AT as VO2 l/min, it is difficult to know how comparable the results of these two investigations might be. Findings reported in a more recent study by Davis et al. (1) indicate that expressing AT as VO2 l/min favors higher correlations (0.94 vs. 0.91) compared with expressing AT as %VO2 max. Our data support this observation and also indicate that such transformations can have a much greater effect on correlation coefficients. For instance, as shown in Table 2 and Fig. 1A, the correlation between AT VH and AT VH was 0.88 when the data were expressed as VO2 l/min. However, when the AT data were transformed to %VO2 max, the correlation between these same indices dropped to 0.69. It appears then that the transformation of AT values to %VO2 max increases (to varying degrees) the homogeneity of the data and thereby produces lower correlation coefficients. Observations similar to this have been made in the study of body composition.

In some of the early studies (7, 13), the AT was determined by using abrupt increases in R above baseline values. More recently though, Wasserman et al. (16) and Davis et al. (2) reported that of the various ventilatory and gas exchange indices used to detect the AT, R was the least sensitive. Our findings are in agreement with these more recent observations, and it should be emphasized that in four of the subjects involved in this study, R rose steadily throughout the entire exercise test and no abrupt systematic increase could be discerned. As pointed out by Wasserman et al. (16) and Davis et al. (2), this may have been due to the elevation of the metabolic respiratory quotient as the work rate was increased. The poor ability to discern the AT using R might explain the disparity between the two previous investigations of Davis et al. (1, 2) that reported markedly different test-retest correlations of the AT. In the earlier investigation (2), AT values were determined by collectively reviewing the plots of VE/VO2, R, and FEO2. By following these procedures, a test-retest correlation of 0.75 was obtained. In the more recent study (1), AT values were chosen, as mentioned above, using VE/VO2, and a test-retest correlation of 0.94 was found. In view of the fact that we found VE/VO2 (which is analogous to FEO2) to be a good index of the AT and R a poor index of the AT, it is not surprising that a lower test-retest correlation was reported in the earlier study of Davis et al. (2).

From the findings of our study, we have identified five factors that favor using VE/VO2 to detect the AT. 1) it has the highest correlation with AT VH; 2) it has the highest test-retest correlation; 3) VE/VO2 can be easily derived from standard ventilatory and gas exchange measures; 4) VE/VO2 exhibits a triphasic pattern that qualitatively allows the investigator to have more confidence in the determination of AT; and 5) the dual criterion utilizing VE/VO2 provides a more specific detection of the AT.

The authors thank Chris McMillan for her efforts in preparing this manuscript.

This investigation was supported in part by National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute Grant HL-11907.

The address for J. A. Davis during this study was Dept. of Medicine, Div. of Respiratory Physiology and Medicine, Harbor-UCLA Medical Center, Torrance, CA 90509.

Received 9 October 1981, accepted in final form 8 June 1982.

REFERENCES


